

The Fast Track for Publishing iPS Research

Shi V. Liu

Eagle Institute of Molecular Medicine
Apex, NC 27502 USA
SVL@logibio.com

(Received 2008-02-25; accepted 2008-05-01; published 2008-05-30*)

HIGHLIGHT

The speed of publishing research reports on iPS cells has created some world records that may be hard to beat. But once the iPS “airplanes” go down people may ask why there was such hurry in release those flawed “airplanes” into the therapeutic cloning “sky”?

ABSTRACT

Within one and half years, at least 20 research reports have been published in various “top” journals. Except for a relatively slow start, the speed of publishing iPS research reports was extremely fast. Some papers were accepted within just two weeks of submission and put online in about three weeks. Why would “top” journals rush in publishing iPS research paper? Did they give these papers the much needed scrutiny? Why all these “top” journals would keep a tight suppression on criticisms on their publications on iPS cells?

KEY WORDS

Stem cell, ES, iPS, Cloning, Induction, Reprogramming, Regeneration, Hype, Spinning, Fast track, Publish

Since the publication of the first iPS research paper in 2006 [1], at least 20 research papers on iPS cells have been published so far (Table 1).

Although there was a little “hesitance” in publishing the first research report on iPS cells [1], once the barrier was broken, the speed of publishing iPS research has become faster and faster, especially for some selected research groups.

For examples, Yamanaka’s second iPS paper submitted to *Cell* was accepted in 13 days and published in 22 days. A few other iPS researchers seemed also to have the capability of running the fast tracks in publishing.

However, coming with this rush was also some relaxing of scrutiny. As a matter of fact, these “top” journals even did not care about doing a descent job because some very obvious mistakes happened in the “high quality” journals [2-4]. More amazingly, the fast publication of iPS research reports was made while these journals suppressed the publication of some strong criticisms (<http://im1.biz/Cloning.htm>).

Thus, once the hyping and misrepresentation is realized by the mainstream, it would be a great shame that those “experts” could not detect some obvious flaws in the iPS research. It would also be a great irony that the “top” journals were at the bottom of publishing truth.

Table 1. A chronological list of experimental research reports on iPS cells

No	Reference	Group	Received	Revised	Accepted	Publish online	Publish in print	Accepted	Published **
1	Takahashi 2006 [1]	1	2006-04-24	2006-06-18	2006-06-20	2006-08-10	<i>Cell</i> 126:663, 2006	<2m	~4m
2	Okita et al 2007 [5]	1	2007-02-06		2007-05-22	2007-06-06	<i>Nature</i> 448:313, 2007	~3m	~4m
3	Wernig et al 2007 [6]	2	2007-02-27		2007-05-22	2007-06-06	<i>Nature</i> 448:318, 2007	<3m	~4m
4	Maherali et al 2007 [7]	3	2007-03-31	2007-05-04	2007-05-14	2007-06-06	<i>Cell Stem Cell</i> 1: 50, 2007	<2m	~2m
5	Belloch et al 2007 [8]	4	NR	NR	NR	NR	<i>Cell Stem Cell</i> 1: 245, 2007	NA	NA
6	Mann et al [9]	9	NR	NR	NR	NR	<i>Nature Method</i> August 2007 page i	NA	NA
7	Meissner et al [10]	2	2007-05-29		2007-08-09	2007-08-27	<i>Nature Biotechnol.</i> 25:1177, 2007	<3m	~3m
8	Qin et al. [11]	7	NR	NR	NR	2007-11-06	<i>Cell Res.</i> 17: 959,2007	NA	NA
9	Yu et al 2007 [12]	5	2007-10-09		2007-11-14	2007-11-20	<i>Science</i> 318:1927, 2007	35d	42d
10	Hanna et al 2007 [13]	2	2007-10-23		2007-11-26	2007-12-06	<i>Science</i> 318: 1920, 2007	33d	42d
11	Takahashi et al 2007 [14]	1	2007-10-29	2007-11-07	2007-11-12	2007-11-20	<i>Cell</i> 131: 861, 2007	13d	22d
12	Nakagawa et al 2007 [15]	1	2007-11-06		2007-11-23	2007-11-30	<i>Nature Biotechnol.</i> 26: 101, 2008	17d	24d
13	Brambrink et al [16]	2	2007-11-15	2007-12-20	2008-01-11	2008-02-06 (P)	<i>Cell Stem Cell</i> 2:151, 2008	<2m	<3m
14	Park et al 2007 [17]	6	2007-11-16		2007-12-10	2007-12-23	<i>Nature</i> 451: 141, 2008	24d	37d
15	Masaki et al [18]	8	2007-12-01	2008-01-09	2008-01-12		<i>Stem Cell Res.</i> 1:105,2008	33d	
16	Aoi et al [19]	1	2008-01-07		2008-02-07	2008-02-14	<i>Science</i> (AOP)	30	37

17	Stadtfeld et al [20]	3	2008-01-20	2008-02-04	2008-02-05	2008-02-14	<i>Cell Stem Cell</i> 2:1,2008	16	25
18	Lowry et al [21]	10	2007-12-05	2007-12-19	?	2008-02-26	<i>PNAS</i> 105:2883,2008	NA	81
19	Liao et al [22]	11	NR	NR	NR	2008-04-15	<i>Cell Res</i> 18:600,2008	NA	NA
20	Hanna et al [23]	2	2008-02-19	2008-03-19	2008-03-26	2008-04-17	<i>Cell</i> 133:250,2008	37	56

* Group: 1= Yamanaka's lab; 2=Jaenisch's lab; 3=Hochedlinger's lab; 4=Ramalho-Santos' lab; 5=Thomson' lab; 6 Daley's lab, 7 D. Pei's lab, 8 =Masaki et al; 9 =Mann et al; 10 = Plath's lab. 11 = G. Pei's lab.

** Publishing speed based on first publication either online or in print.

NR: Not revealed; NA: not applicable; AOP = Advanced online publication

References

1. Takahashi K, Yamanaka S: **Induction of pluripotent stem cells from mouse embryonic and adult fibroblast cultures by defined factors.** *Cell* 2006, **126**:663-676.
2. Liu SV: **Towards a balanced view on iPS Cells.** *Logical Biology* 2008, **8**:32-38.
3. Liu SV: **The final blow-up of the induction and reprogramming claim for iPS cells.** *Logical Biology* 2008, **In press.**
4. Liu SV: **iPS cells: a more critical review.** *Stem Cells Dev Published advanced online doi: 10.1089/scd.2008.0062* 2008.
5. Okita K, Ichisaka T, Yamanaka S: **Generation of germline-competent induced pluripotent stem cells.** *Nature* 2007, **448**:313-317.
6. Wernig M, Meissner A, Foreman R, Brambrink T, Ku M, Hochedlinger K, Bernstein BE, Jaenisch R: **In vitro reprogramming of fibroblasts into a pluripotent ES-cell-like state.** *Nature* 2007, **448**:318-324.
7. Maherali N, Sridharan R, Xie W, Utikal J, Eminli S, Arnold K, Stadtfeld M, Yachechko R, Tchieu J, Jaenisch R, et al: **Directly reprogrammed fibroblasts show global epigenetic remodeling and widespread tissue contribution.** *Cell Stem Cell* 2007, **1**:55-70.
8. Bluelloch R, Venere M, Yen J, Ramalho-Santo M: **Generation of induced pluripotent stem cells in the absence of drug selection.** *Cell Stem Cell* 2007, **1**:245-247.
9. Mann CJ, Newman ENC, Whitney DJ, Latchem NJ, Bramke I, Burke JF: **Stem and iPS cell selection: quantitation of surface marker (SSEA1) and intracellular GFP.** *Nature Method* 2007, **August**:i-ii.
10. Meissner A, Wernig M, Jaenisch R: **Direct reprogramming of genetically unmodified fibroblasts into pluripotent stem cells.** *Nat Biotechnol* 2007, **25**:1177-1181.
11. Qin D, Li W, Zhang J, Pei D: **Direct generation of ES-like cells from unmodified mouse embryonic fibroblasts by Oct4/Sox2/Myc/Klf4.** *Cell Res* 2007, **17**:959-962.
12. Yu J, Vodyanik MA, Smuga-Otto K, Antosiewicz-Bourget J, Frane JL, Tian S, Nie J, Jonsdottir GA, Ruotti V, Stewart R, et al: **Induced pluripotent stem cell lines derived from human somatic cells.** *Science* 2007, **318**:1917-1920.
13. Hanna J, Wernig M, Markoulaki S, Sun C-W, Meissner A, Cassady JP, Beard C, Brambrink T, Wu L-C, Townes TM, Jaenisch R: **Treatment of sickle cell anemia mouse model with iPS cells generated from autologous skin.** *Science* 2007, **318**:1920-1923.
14. Takahashi K, Tanabe K, Ohnuki M, Ichisaka T, Tomoda K, Yamanaka S: **Induction of pluripotent stem cells from adult human fibroblasts by defined factors.** *Cell* 2007, **131**:861-872.
15. Nakagawa M, Yoyanagi M, Tanabe K, Takahashi K, Ichisaka T, Aoi T, Okita K, Mochiduki Y, Takizawa N, Yamanaka S: **Generation of induced pluripotent stem cells without Myc from mouse and human fibroblasts.** *Nature Biotechnol* 2008, **26**:101-106.

16. Brambrink T, Foreman R, Welstead GG, Lengner CJ, Wernig M, Suh H, Jaenisch R: **Sequential expression of pluripotency markers during direct reprogramming of mouse somatic cells.** *Cell Stem Cell* 2008, **2**:151-159.
17. Park IH, Zhao R, West JA, Yabuuchi A, Huo H, Ince TA, Lerou PH, Lensch MW, Daley GQ: **Reprogramming of human somatic cells to pluripotency with defined factors.** *Nature* 2007, **451**:141-146.
18. Masaki H, Ishikawa T, Takahashi S, Okumura M, Sakai N, Haga M, Kominami K, Migita H, McDonald F, Shimada F, Sakurada K: **Heterogeneity of pluripotent marker gene expression in colonies generated in human iPS cell induction culture.** *Stem Cell Res* 2008, **1**:105-115.
19. Aoi T, Yae K, Nakagawa M, Ichisaka T, Okita K, Takahashi K, Chiba T, Yamanaka S: **Generation of pluripotent stem cells from adult mouse liver and stomach cells.** *Science* 2007, **AOP February 14, 2008**:DOI 10.1126/science.1154884.
20. Stadtfeld M, Maherali N, Breault D, Hochedlinger K: **Defining molecular cornerstones during fibroblast to iPS cell reprogramming in mouse.** *Cell Stem Cell* 2008, **2**:1-11.
21. Lowry WE, Richter L, Yachechko R, Pyle AD, Tchieu J, Sridharan R, Clark AT, Plath K: **Generation of human induced pluripotent stem cells from dermal fibroblasts.** *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2008, **105**:2883-2888.
22. Liao J, Wu Z, Wang Y, Cheng L, Cui C, Gao Y, Chen T, Rao L, Chen S, Jia N, et al: **Enhanced efficiency of generating induced pluripotent stem (iPS) cells from human somatic cells by a combination of six transcription factors.** *Cell Res* 2008, **18**:600-603.
23. Hanna J, Markoulaki S, Schorderet P, Carey BW, Beard C, Wernig M, Creghton MP, Steine EJ, Cassady JP, Foreman R, et al: **Direct reprogramming of terminally differentiated mature B lymphocytes to pluripotency.** *Cell* 2008, **133**:250-264.

(Please visit <http://im1.biz/FastTrack.htm> for update on this table)